

SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

Randy I. Dorn Old Capitol Building · PO BOX 47200 · Olympia, WA 98504-7200 · http://www.k12.wa.us

RE: Carolyn Bilal OSPI Case No.:D07-02-012 Document: Denial Order for Certification

Regarding your request for information about the above-named educator; attached is a true and correct copy of the document on file with the State of Washington, Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction, Office of Professional Practices. These records are considered certified by the Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction.

Certain information may have been redacted pursuant to Washington state laws. While those laws require that most records be disclosed on request, they also state that certain information should not be disclosed.

The following information has been withheld: NONE

If you have any questions or need additional information regarding the information that was redacted, if any, please contact:

OSPI Public Records Office P.O. Box 47200 Olympia, WA 98504-7200 Phone: (360) 725-6372 Email: <u>PublicRecordsRequest@k12.wa.us</u>

You may appeal the decision to withhold or redact any information by writing to the Superintendent of Public Instruction, OSPI P.O. Box 47200, Olympia, WA 98504-7200.



SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

RANDY I. DORN OLD CAPITOL BUILDING • PO BOX 47200 • OLYMPIA WA 98504-7200 • http://www.k12.wa.us

IN THE MATTER OF THE EDUCATION CERTIFICATE OF

CAROLYN A. BILAL Certificate No. 261734H OPP No. D07-02-012

DENIAL ORDER FOR CERTIFICATION

COMES NOW the Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction (OSPI), under the authority granted by the laws of the state of Washington, having reviewed the file of the abovereferenced case, and having considered the entire evidence contained therein, does hereby deny the education application of Carolyn A. Bilal, based on the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law set forth below:

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. Carolyn Bilal was issued a Washington Education Certificate, No. 261734H, on August 17, 1984. On June 28, 2010, after a hearing, Administrative Law Judge Michelle Mentzer issued a <u>Findings of Fact, Conclusion of Law, and Order</u> upholding OSPI's Final Order of Revocation of Education Certificate, No. 261734H of Carolyn Bilal.

2. Carolyn Bilal was employed by the Seattle Public School District.

CAROLYN A. BILAL DENIAL ORDER FOR CERTIFICATION

-1-

3. On February 5, 2007, the Office of Professional Practices, within OSPI, received a complaint letter from the superintendent of the Seattle Public School District alleging a lack of good moral character or personal fitness, or a violation of the Code of Professional Conduct, Washington Administrative Code (WAC) 181-87, by Carolyn Bilal.

4. From February 5, 2007 to October 10, 2008, the Office of Professional Practices (OPP) conducted an investigation into the allegations of Carolyn Bilal lacking of good moral character or personal fitness, or had violated of the Code of Professional Conduct.

5. On October 10, 2008, OPP issued a Proposed Order of Revocation for the Education Certificate of Carolyn Bilal, No. 261734H. On November 17, 2008, Carolyn Bilal timely appealed the proposed revocation.

6. On April 3, 2009, OPP issued an Amended Proposed Order of Revocation for the Education Certificate of Carolyn Bilal, No. 261734H. On April 30, 2009, Carolyn Bilal timely appealed the proposed revocation.

CAROLYN A. BILAL DENIAL ORDER FOR CERTIFICATION

-2-

7. On June 28, 2010, subsequent to the informal appeal process and a formal administrative law hearing, Administrative Law Judge Mentzer issued a <u>Findings of Fact, Conclusion of Law,</u> <u>and Order</u> upholding OSPI's Final Order of Revocation for Education Certificate No. 261734H of Carolyn Bilal. In the decision, among other comments, Judge Mentzer wrote, "The Appellant has a behavioral problem of deliberately misrepresenting her identity, date of birth, employment history, criminal history, and professional qualifications..."; "the behavioral problem has spanned..."; "the evidence clearly and convincingly establishes that the Appellant lacks 'good moral character and personal fitness"; and "The Appellant's behavioral problem presents a danger to the educational welfare of the students".

8. On April 29, 2014, Carolyn Bilal submitted an Application for Reinstatement of Suspended or Revoked Washington State Certification.

9. On the Application for Reinstatement of Suspended or Revoked Washington State Certification, Carolyn Bilal was asked to provide her employment history for the past ten (10) years. Carolyn Bilal falsely answered 'No' to the question of "I have not been employed in an education setting." Carolyn Bilal failed to list any employer information in the Educational Experience section and falsely did not include previous employment with the Seattle School District; which was terminated in 2007.

CAROLYN A. BILAL DENIAL ORDER FOR CERTIFICATION

-3-

11. On the Application for Reinstatement of Suspended or Revoked Washington State Certification, Carolyn Bilal was asked to provide her employment history for the past ten (10) years under Non-Educational Experience, Carolyn Bilal listed two (2) employers. The first, Special Counsel, Carolyn Bilal states she was employed as "Legal" from November 2013 to December 2013. The second, Washington state Department of Employment Security, Carolyn Bilal states she is currently employed as a "Workforce Specialist/Resource Room" and has been since March 2014.

12. On the Character and Fitness Supplement, a part of the application process, Carolyn Bilal answered 'yes' to questions 1, 3, 4, 8, 10, and 11, Professional Fitness; which is "Have you ever held or do you currently hold a Washington education certificate?"; "Are you currently or have you ever been the subject of any certificate or licensing investigation or inquiry by any certification or licensing agency for allegations of misconduct?"; "Have you ever had any adverse action taken on any certificate or license?"; "Have you ever been dismissed, discharged, or fired from any employment position involving children or dependent adults?"; "Have you ever been disciplined by a past or present employer because of allegations of misconduct?"; and "Are you currently or have you ever been the subject of any investigation or inquiry by an employer because of allegations of misconduct?"

CAROLYN A. BILAL DENIAL ORDER FOR CERTIFICATION

-4-

13. In her required written response to "yes" answers on the Character and Fitness Supplement section of the Application for Reinstatement of Suspended or Revoked Washington State Certification, Carolyn Bilal responds to question #4, "Have you ever had any adverse action taken on any certificate or license?", with:

My certificate was "revoked". A complaint letter with unsubstantiated allegations of misconduct against me was submitted to OSPI. The allegations were based upon (originally) another individual who had stolen my identity. Because I stood for my rights and refuted the allegations additional fictious [sic] allegations were made about me that were without evidence and or substantiation, and were used to "revoke" my credentials. <u>Attached</u> is the identity letter for my personal information. As well <u>attached</u> is a letter from Employment Security Department confirming the complaint allegations were meritless, as reported by Seattle School District.

14. In her required written response to "yes" answers on the Character and Fitness Supplement section of the Application for Reinstatement of Suspended or Revoked Washington State Certification, Carolyn Bilal responds to question #8, "Have you ever been dismissed, discharged, or fired from any employment position involving children or dependent adults?", with:

I was terminated from my job related to the above facts and discrimination, alleging I was a "danger" – "endangering" children which was and is a manifest untruth. I was working for Seattle School District in a high school career specialist position 2006 when the allegations that were dated back in the 60's, 70's, 80's, 90's were brought up (and were untrue), regarding misconduct.

CAROLYN A. BILAL DENIAL ORDER FOR CERTIFICATION

-5-

15. In her required written response to "yes" answers on the Character and Fitness Supplement section of the Application for Reinstatement of Suspended or Revoked Washington State Certification, Carolyn Bilal responds to question #10, "Have you ever been disciplined by a past or present employer because of allegations of misconduct?", with:

I was terminated in violation of my union (see attached) contract that states anything, acts, etc not brought to my attention within 10 days <u>cannot</u> be used for displinary [sic] (see attached. None of the allegations made by Seattle Schools were even brought to my attention until 2006-2007, 2008, 2010.

16. In her required written response to "yes" answers on the Character and Fitness Supplement section of the Application for Reinstatement of Suspended or Revoked Washington State Certification, Carolyn Bilal responds to question #11,"Are you currently or have you ever been the subject of any investigation or inquiry by an employer because of allegations of misconduct?", with:

Same as above, - Seattle Schools discriminated against me to initiate an investigation because they wanted to get "rid" of me which from my perspective was nothing more than personal bias of 2 Seattle Schools employees. (See attached)

17. On the Character and Fitness Supplement, a part of the application process, Carolyn Bilal answered 'no' to question 1, Fitness, "Have you ever exhibited any behavior or conduct which might negatively impact your ability to serve in a role which requires a certificate, credential, or license?"

CAROLYN A. BILAL DENIAL ORDER FOR CERTIFICATION

-6-

18. On April 18, 2014, Carolyn Bilal submitted copies of her fingerprints for a fingerprint based criminal history background check.

19. On July 15, 2014, Carolyn Bilal was sent a letter by OPP. In the letter, Carolyn Bilal was advised that during the application process, the burden of proof is upon the applicant to verify that they have good moral character and personal fitness required to become and remain a certificated education practitioner, per Washington Administrative Code (WAC) 181-86-013 and/or -014, and that her previously submitted documents had not shown by clear and convincing evidence that she met the requirements of WAC 181-86-013. OPP notified Carolyn Bilal that she was required to submit to and complete a psychological evaluation to validate her ability to have unsupervised access to children and if the evaluation provider recommended any treatment or therapy, she would be required to complete any and all treatment prior to further review and consideration.

20. On July 30, 2014, Carolyn Bilal responded to OPP. Carolyn Bilal declined to submit to and complete a psychological evaluation to validate her ability to have unsupervised access to children. Carolyn Bilal wrote, "OPP/OSPI has never alluded or alleged I have a psychological or behavioral problem nor are either in receipt of any knowledge, information, written complaint, act or activity concerning an authenticated psychological or behavioral problem related to me."

-7-

CAROLYN A. BILAL DENIAL ORDER FOR CERTIFICATION 21. On August 1, 2014, OPP sent Carolyn Bilal a letter reiterated the requirement that she submit to and complete a psychological evaluation to validate her ability to have unsupervised access to children. A copy of Administrative Law Judge Mentzer's Final Order of Revocation for Education Certificate No. 261734H was included.

22. On August 15, 2014, Carolyn Bilal responded to OPP and. among other comments, requests a list of individuals she could contact to begin the psychological evaluation process.

23. On August 19, 2014, OPP sent Carolyn Bilal responding to her most recent correspondence. OPP advised Carolyn Bilal, among other comments, that she had until September 1, 2014 to provide confirmation that she was locating a psychologist/psychiatrist to complete the required evaluation.

24. On August 26, 2014, Carolyn Bilal responded to OPP. In the letter, among other comments, Carolyn Bilal contested Administrative Law Judge Mentzer decision stating, "Mentzer's opinion was nothing more than afterthought that was contrary to law inserted in the finding of fact and conclusion of law, in her final order." And "...Mentzer's personal opinion in the matter is and was discriminatory and violates both my civil and due process rights to be heard."

CAROLYN A. BILAL DENIAL ORDER FOR CERTIFICATION

-8-

25. On September 10, 2014, OPP sent Carolyn Bilal a letter advising that OPP was in the process of completing the review of her application for reinstatement and would make a decision. Carolyn Bilal was advised that if she chose to locate a psychologist to perform the required psychological evaluation, she could provide that person's information for OPP to review as part of the application process.

26. As of February 5, 2015, OPP has not received information from Carolyn Bilal concerning a psychological evaluation.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

1. OSPI has jurisdiction over Carolyn A. Bilal and over the subject matter of this action.

2. Carolyn Bilal has failed to provide clear and convincing evidence of good moral character and personal fitness to receive a Washington education certificate, under Washington Administrative Code (WAC) 181-86-113 and WAC 181-86-170.

-9-

CAROLYN A. BILAL

DENIAL ORDER FOR CERTIFICATION

ORDER

THEREFORE, it is hereby ordered that the Washington Education Certificate, No. 261734H, of Carolyn A. Bilal be denied.

This order will become final thirty days after the postmarked date of mailing, unless it is appealed within the thirty day period.

Appeals should be addressed to:

Superintendent of Public Instruction Office of Professional Practices PO Box 47200 Olympia, WA 98504

DATED This _____ day of _ March

, 2015.

RANDY I. DORN Superintendent of Public Instruction State of Washington

Gil Mendoza, Ed. D. Assistant Superintendent K-12 Education

CAROLYN A. BILAL DENIAL ORDER FOR CERTIFICATION